

TSG Summary of February 2015 USAF

"Report on Recommendations of the National Commission on the Structure of the Air Force"
<http://projects.militarytimes.com/pdfs/Air-Force-Report-on-the-National-Commission-on-the-Structure-of-the-Air.pdf>

Report's Executive Summary Excerpts:

"The United States Air Force is pleased to provide its response to the recommendations set forth by the National Commission on the Structure of the Air Force. The Air Force appreciates the significant efforts of the commission and their report serves as an invaluable tool which has accentuated our efforts to shape the future of the world's greatest Air Force...."

"...Through careful analysis of the commission's report, the Air Force has charted a path to an increasingly well-balanced, capable, and integrated force. Of the 42 recommendations, the Air Force concurs with, and is already taking steps toward implementing, 25 recommendations. Further, it also agrees with the intent of, and is developing comprehensive implementation plans or pilot programs for, another 16 recommendations. The Air Force disagrees with only one recommendation: the disestablishment of the Air Force Reserve Command. While this action on the surface may seem plausible, it would not result in savings and would remove the Chief of the Air Force Reserve's ability to manage Reserve resources and appropriations as required by key statutory obligations...."

"...Many of the recommendations require appropriate planning and, in a number of cases, external assistance to achieve the desired end states. Consequently, through the Total Force Initiative Executive Committee, the Air Force has a plan in place to move forward and, in future reports to Congress, will describe our continued progress toward building a more integrated Total Force...."

"...Embracing the commission's intent, the Air Force viewed the recommendations as a holistic approach to improving the Service. Although this report details the Air Force's views, analysis, and implementation plans for all 42 of the commission's recommendations, the Air Force is advancing an additional 32 initiatives, many of which were conceived before the establishment of the commission. As one example, the Air Force Recruiting Information Support System-Total Force allows recruiters from all components to inclusively view all three components' applicants and share information...."

TPG Analysis

As noted in the recent USAF Report Executive Summary, USAF states to agree in whole or in part to all but one NCSAF Recommendation, that to dissolve the Air Force reserve Command as shown at APPENDIX 1. Also as shown at APPENDIX 1, TPG notes that of the remaining 41 recommendations, only 15 are shown as fully agreed to by USAF, showing no qualifying conditions or statements.

TPG finds that 14 of the recommendations where USAF expressed qualifications, may have some level of direct impact on the basing, mission, or military value of bases or installations (APPENDIX 2):

Of particular interest or concern are NCSAF Recommendations #9, #10, #11, and #12 which indicate unresolved issues between USAF and the NCSAF Commission, potentially impacting the formation and stand-up of "active associate" units, and/or total force integration of manpower or equipment.

APPENDIX 1: USAF Did Not Agree with One NCSAF Recommendation:

NCSAF Recommendation #5—Air Force Reserve Command

“Congress should amend 10 U.S.C. §10174 to retain the statutory rank, roles, responsibilities, and functions of the Director, Air National Guard, and Chief of the Air Force Reserve but disestablish the Air Force Reserve Command. The Air Force should inactivate the Reserve Numbered Air Forces, wings, and squadrons. The roles, responsibilities, and functions of disestablished organizations should be assumed by the Secretary of the Air Force, Headquarters Air Force, and MAJCOMS, all of which will have increased representation by Air Reserve Component Airmen, as determined by the Secretary of the Air Force.”

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force disagrees with this recommendation. “As the National Commission on the Structure of the Air Force highlighted, the Total Force cannot succeed without three strong components... The Air Force is concerned that this recommendation lacks the research, data, or analysis required to disregard six decades of organizational lessons learned and undo congressionally instituted reforms that have led to today's cost-efficient and mission-effective force for our nation. This recommendation would also weaken the Chief of Air Force Reserve's ability to execute key statutory obligations in the management of congressionally authorized and appropriated resources. It would place at risk the sustained readiness of Air Force Reserve forces, which afford the nation operational capability, strategic depth, and surge capacity across all Air Force core missions. Finally, this recommendation would increase inefficiency, functional duplication, and cost, as the necessary functions currently performed by Air Force Reserve Command would need to be distributed and multiplied across the other Air Force major commands and headquarters.”

Fifteen Recommendations Where USAF “Agrees with This Recommendation,” without Qualification

1. NCSAF Recommendation #6—Staff Integration
2. NCSAF Recommendation #8—Full-Time and Part-Time Mix
3. NCSAF Recommendation #13—DOC Statements
4. NCSAF Recommendation #15—Effective Control Measures
5. NCSAF Recommendation #16—Awards, Decorations, and Promotions
6. NCSAF Recommendation #18—Total Force Competency Standard
7. NCSAF Recommendation #19—Access to Non-Resident Education
8. NCSAF Recommendation #21—Operational ARC Funding
9. NCSAF Recommendation #22—Council of Governors
10. NCSAF Recommendation #23—Non-Disclosure Agreements
11. NCSAF Recommendation #24—State Adjutants General
12. NCSAF Recommendation #34—Integrated Personnel Management
13. NCSAF Recommendation #35—Integrated Pay and Personnel System
14. NCSAF Recommendation #38—PERSTEMPO and AF-IPPS

15. NCSAF Recommendation #41—Multiple Career Track Options

APPENDIX 2: TPG Team Capture of 14 Ncsaf Recommendations Impacting Basing/Mission/Military Value that Had One or More Statement of Qualification

NCSAF Recommendation #4—Infrastructure

“The Air Force should consider, and Congress should allow, the closing or warm basing of some installations.”

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in part. “The Air Force recognizes that full implementation of this recommendation will require collaboration with Congress....”

NCSAF Recommendation #7—AFR Unit Integration *

“The Chief of Staff of the Air Force should direct the integration of Air Force Reserve associations of flights, squadrons, groups, and wings into corresponding Active Component organizations in order to eliminate the current redundant organizational overhead found in classic associations.”

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in part. “The Air Force agrees that opportunities may exist in associate constructs to streamline organizations through collocation and functional integration. However, the Air Force does not support the disestablishment of Air Force Reserve flights, squadrons, and groups to integrate into corresponding active component organizations.”

NCSAF Recommendation #9—ANG Unit Integration *

“The Chief of Staff of the Air Force should direct the integration of Air Force flights, squadrons, groups, and wings into corresponding Air National Guard organizations in order to eliminate the current redundant organizational overhead found in active associations.”

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in principle. “The Air Force is taking action to develop a comprehensive implementation plan for this recommendation. The integration of active component Air Force into Air National Guard organizations via active associations shows potential for increased efficiencies. First steps toward unit integration are underway between Air Combat Command and the National Guard Bureau with establishment of a steady-state dual status commander test-case at the 169th Fighter Wing active association at McEntire Joint National Guard Base, South Carolina. This test case will provide data on issues that need to be overcome, and potential solutions moving forward. The Air Force may realize some efficiency and manpower savings by combining and integrating staff functions. Although the active component Air Force and Air National Guard already integrate while remaining fully under separate federal and state command authorities, a single commander could provide a cleaner command chain for members of both components....”

NCSAF Recommendation #10—ANG Unit Size *

"The Chief of Staff of the Air Force, in coordination with the Director of the Air National Guard, should change wing-level organizations to group organizations where the Airmen population and associated equipment are more realistically sized at the group level. The unnecessary recent growth of ANG wings from groups created excessive overhead positions that detract from availability to directly support training, peacetime, and wartime missions."

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in principle. "The Air Force has taken action to implement this recommendation and is working to ensure that all of its organizations are appropriately sized...."

NCSAF Recommendation #11—Concurrent Fielding of Equipment

"As the Air Force acquires new equipment, force integration plans should adhere to the principle of proportional and concurrent fielding across the components. This means that, in advance of full integration, new equipment will arrive at Air Reserve Component units simultaneously with its arrival at Active Component units in the proportional share of each component. As the Air Force Reserve and Active Component become fully integrated, the Air Force should ensure that the Air National Guard receives new technology concurrent with the integrated units. The Air Force should no longer recapitalize by cascading equipment from the Active Component to the Reserve Components."

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in principle. "The Air Force is taking action to develop a comprehensive implementation plan for this recommendation consistent with the Air Force Strategy...."

NCSAF Recommendation #12—Policy Revisions*

"Integrating units will require manpower and personnel policy revisions. The Air Force should modify Air Force Instruction 90-1001 "Responsibilities for Total Force Integration" to establish selection and assignment criteria, the minimum proportion of leadership positions that must be filled by the associating components, and the methods to ensure compliance. The AF/A1 and Air Force Personnel Center should then reassign Airmen in disestablished Air Force Reserve units to integrated Title 10 units composed of Active Air Force, Reserve, full-time and part-time Airmen."

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in part. "The Air Force is taking action to implement this recommendation. While the Air Force agrees that full integration will require manpower and personnel policy revisions, the Air Force does not agree that these changes should be reflected in Air Force Instruction 90-1001, Responsibilities for Total Force Integration...."

NCSAF Recommendation #20—Increase ARC Capacity

"The Air Force should increase its utilization of the Air Reserve Component by increasing the routine employment of ARC units and individuals to meet recurring rotational requirements. The measure of success in this increased use of the ARC should be the execution of at least 15,000 man-years annually."

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in principle. "This recommendation mirrors the verbiage in National Commission on the Structure of the Air Force recommendation #3, Part 2...."

NCSAF Recommendation #25—Cyberspace Airmen

"As it increases the number of Airmen in career fields associated with Cyberspace, the Air Force should fill much of that demand with the Reserve Components, which are well situated to recruit and retain from the specialized talent available in the commercial cyber labor market."

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in principle." The Air Force is taking steps to expand the air reserve component capacity in the cyberspace mission areas while ensuring the optimal force mix. The Air Force is addressing this National Commission on the Structure of the Air Force recommendation through Air Force Space Command's Cost Benefit Analysis...."

NCSAF Recommendation #26—Space Domain

"The Air Force should build more Air Reserve Component opportunities in the space domain, especially in predictable continuity of operations missions and round-the-clock shift work."

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in principle. "The Air Force is taking steps to expand air reserve component capacity in the space domain mission areas while ensuring the optimal force mix...."

NCSAF Recommendation #28—Special Operations

"The Air Force should increase Air Reserve Component presence in Special Operations through greater integration."

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in principle. "The Air Force acknowledges that collaboration with United States Special Operations Command, the Office of the Secretary of Defense, and Congress is required to fully implement this recommendation. The Air Force is taking action to implement this recommendation and to expand air reserve component capacity through greater Total Force integration in the special operations mission area while ensuring the optimal force mix...."

NCSAF Recommendation #30—Instructor Pilots

"The Air Force should replace some of the 1,800 Active instructor pilots with prior-service volunteers from the Air Reserve Component who would not rotate back to operational squadrons."

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in principle. "The Air Force is taking steps to expand air reserve component capacity through greater Total Force integration of the instructor pilot population

while ensuring the optimal force mix. Legislative relief as requested in the FY16 Omnibus would greatly facilitate air reserve component instructor pilots' ability to train active component and foreign military pilots...."

NCSAF Recommendation #31—Homeland Security and Disaster Assistance

"The President should direct the Departments of Defense and Homeland Security to develop, in full coordination with the Council of Governors, national requirements for Homeland Security and Disaster Assistance, both foreign and domestic."

Assessment of this Recommendation

"The Air Force agrees with this recommendation and acknowledges that implementation of this recommendation can only be accomplished through close collaboration with the Department of Defense and the Department of Homeland Security after Presidential direction compels governmental agencies to work with the Council of Governors. The Air Force also believes that the directive should include the Department of State with respect to foreign humanitarian assistance and disaster relief missions as it is the lead federal agency for foreign affairs with Department of Defense in support.

The Air Force has taken action to implement this recommendation. The Air Force has enhanced coordination and consultation with the Council of Governors in accordance with the recently revised agreement between the council and the Secretary of Defense. The established Council of Governors' "Consultative Process" fulfills this recommendation's requirement to address Homeland Security and Civil Support domestically...."

NCSAF Recommendation #32—Homeland Defense and DSCA

"DoD and the Air Force should treat Homeland Defense and DSCA as real priorities and Governors as essential stakeholders in planning processes...."

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in principle. "The Air Force is taking action to implement this recommendation. The Air Force has enhanced coordination and consultation with the Council of Governors in accordance with the recently revised agreement between the council and the Secretary of Defense. The established Council of Governors "consultative process" fulfills this recommendation's requirement to address Homeland Defense and Civil Support domestically...."

NCSAF Recommendation #42—"Up or Out"

"Congress should amend restrictive aspects of current statutes that mandate "up-or-out" career management policies to enable the Air Force to retain Airmen of all components actively working in career fields where substantial investment in training and career development has been made and where it serves the needs of the Air Force."

Assessment of this Recommendation

The Air Force agrees with this recommendation in principle. "The Air Force is taking action to develop a comprehensive implementation plan for this recommendation. The current construct is built on an "up or out" system that requires Airmen to grow from technical experts to leaders. The system does allow for most Airmen to reach retirement through high year tenure, selective continuation, and if applicable,

mandatory service date; however, it does not allow for Airmen to remain technical experts for as long as they desire....”